Attachment C

MEMORANDUM

To: Clean Energy Partnership Board

From: Planning Team

Date: 11-12-15

Subject: Adopting Metrics to track progress on Clean Energy Partnership Activities

The 2015-2016 Work Plan adopted by the Clean Energy Partnership (CEP) Board on May 29th, 2015 charged the Planning Team to work with the Energy Vision Advisory Committee (EVAC) to develop a set of metrics to track progress towards Clean Energy Partnership goals. These metrics will form the basis of the annual progress report presented to the Board, as well as regular progress updates given to the Board and EVAC . The Planning Team worked with EVAC at two of their quarterly meetings, and in a subgroup outside of regular EVAC meetings, to develop a consensus recommendation on a list of metrics. That list is presented in this memo for consideration by the Board.

Process

The Planning Team presented a list of potential metrics, originally identified in the CEP's two-year Work Plan, to EVAC at their August 18th meeting. A small group of EVAC members volunteered to work outside of the regular meetings to discuss the potential metrics and potential additions or changes. This subgroup made their recommendation to the full meeting of EVAC on November 10th. A description of the recommendation made by that group, which was drafted by a group member, is attached as Appendix A. The final list of proposed metrics is attached as Appendix B.

During the EVAC meeting on November 10th, an amendment was made and adopted by the Committee to add an additional metric (labeled 8.2 in Appendix B) to track the "conversion rate" of participants in the Multi-Family Building Efficiency Program. This metric would identify what percentage of buildings that engaged in the audit and direct installation portion eventually went on to undertake deeper retrofits.

It should be noted that the 2015-2016 Work Plan proposed metrics tie directly to the City's Climate Action Plan. Achievement of these goals may entail long term engagement strategies. The City's energy related Climate Action Plan goals that align with the Clean Energy Partnership Work Plan are as follows:

1. Reduce GHG emissions 30% by 2025 (from 2006 levels)
2. Increase efficiency of commercial buildings 20% from growth baseline by 2025
3. Increase efficiency of residential buildings 15% from growth baseline by 2025
4. Increase local or directly purchased renewable energy to 10% of total by 2025

5. Help 75% of homeowners participate in whole house energy efficiency retrofit programs by 2025 (with equitable distribution)
6. Help 75% of 5+ unit buildings participate in multi-family EE program by 2025 (with equitable distribution)

Planning Team Recommendation

The Planning Team recommends that the CEP Board adopt the list of metrics attached as Appendix B. This recommendation is in consensus with the EVAC position adopted at their November 10th meeting. If adopted, the Planning Team will begin collecting data on the metrics to produce the CEP annual report for the second quarter meeting of the CEP Board in 2016.

In addition to the metrics, EVAC suggested that the goals of the Partnership and Climate Action Plan be expanded to include the following language, "eliminating disparities by income and race." EVAC suggested that this action will highlight the commitment by all involved to give consideration of energy equity across programs. EVAC also recognizes that the metrics as proposed include measurement and tracking of factors required to track progress related to this proposed goal.

While this language is similar to language on reducing disparities in utility program participation and relative energy costs in the City's Energy Vision, Clean Energy Partnership 2015-2016 Work Plan, and Climate Action Plan, it is new language. By tracking utility program participation by Census tract, and producing additional demographic data on race, ethnicity, income and rental or ownership status, the Planning Team intends to measure progress on reducing disparities within the scope of the Partnership activities.

The charge to the Planning Team from the Board at their May meeting did not include revising the Clean Energy Partnership Work Plan goals, and the City Council has not acted to amend the Climate Action Plan. For these reasons, the Planning Team's recommendation is to continue to collect data to better understand disparities in utility program participation and Partnership activities, and design engagement strategies to reduce disparities, consistent with the existing goals of the Climate Action Plan, Energy Vision, and current two-year Partnership Work Plan. The Planning Team will be reporting on disparities through the annual report to both EVAC and the Clean Energy Partnership Board.

Next Steps

If the recommended metrics are adopted by the Board, the Planning Team will continue the data collection process to produce the first annual progress report, for distribution in the second quarter of 2016. This first report will provide data on the metrics, but also take a historical view on programs (for example, showing usage of the Home Energy Squad program starting in 2009) to understand the baseline of activity that has occurred in the City, and where challenges and opportunities may lie.

The baseline information will also provide a richer understanding of the existing disparities in program participation across geographic communities, so EVAC and the Board can be better informed about prioritizing engagement strategies.

Attachment C

APPENDIX A

Summary Metrics Recommendation
Energy Vision Advisory Committee - Clean Energy Partnership

Working Group Attendees: Bridget Dockter, Trevor Drake, Chris Duffin, John Farrell, Nick Mark, Katie Schmitt, Brendon Slotterback and William Weber

The Energy Vision Advisory Committee sub-group met twice to discuss the metrics put forward in the current two year plan of the Clean Energy Partnership. Consideration was given to both the intent and the scope of the proposed metrics. The working group expressed an interest in metrics that were comprehensive; balanced; practical; align with and inform programs; and consider issues of equity with regard to energy and the impact of energy infrastructure across the community.

The working group concluded that two types of metrics are needed to provide meaningful feedback to the Clean Energy Partnership; primary metrics and effectiveness measures. Primary metrics are measures that correlate directly to the state goals of the Minneapolis Climate Action Plan goals and strategies (below) across work plan items, for example total greenhouse gas emissions. Effectiveness measures are metrics tracking program efficacy and impact related to work plan items, for example geography and demographics.

Climate Action Plan Goals & Strategies

1. Reduce GHG emissions 30% by 2025 (from 2006 levels)
2. Increase efficiency of commercial buildings 20% from growth baseline by 2025
3. Increase efficiency of residential buildings 15% from growth baseline by 2025
4. Increase local or directly purchased renewable energy to 10% of total by 2025
5. Help 75% of homeowners participate in whole house energy efficiency retrofit programs by 2025 (with equitable distribution)
6. Help 75% of 5+ unit buildings participate in multi-family EE program by 2025 (with equitable distribution)

The metric working group recommends the goals for the CEP from the Climate Action Plan be expanded to include the following language, “eliminating disparities by income and race.” This action will highlight the commitment by all involved to give consideration of energy equity across programs. The metrics as propose included measurement and tracking of factors required to track progress related to this goal.

The current metrics as noted in the two year plan are made up of both primary metrics and effectiveness measures. They are as follows:

1. Citywide GHG emissions
    - 1.1 GHG emissions from electricity use
    - 1.2 GHG emissions from natural gas use
2. Commercial building energy use
    - 2.1 Commercial building benchmarking results

    2.2 Commercial utility EE program utilization
3. Residential building energy use

4. Local or directly purchase renewable energy
    4.1 Windsource customers
    4.2 Community solar garden subscribers
5. Home Energy Squad visits
    5.1 Percent of eligible properties served by HES
    5.2 HES-driven loans
6. Low-income visits
7. Air sealing/insulation (ASI)
8. Multi-family program participation
    8.1 Percent of eligible MF properties

In addition to the current metrics listed, the working group recommends that the Clean Energy Partnership develop metrics to track the following:

1. Employment and workforce training
2. Woman and Minority Business Participation
3. Economic activity related to EE spending
4. Total city wide greenhouse gas emissions by activity in alignment with the city inventory (roads, solid waste, etc.)

The intent of these additional metrics is to strengthen the measurement of the impact and progress the CEP has on accessibility, economic impact and equity across programs, and track progress toward the cities total greenhouse gas reduction targets. EVAC looks forward to future discussions with the board and planning staff regarding their recommendations of specific methodology to measure these factors.

Specific effectiveness measures should be determined by the partnership related to individual programs. Consideration should be given but not limited to the following:

- customer type
- participation rates
- geography
- demographics
- conversion rates

Geography

The primary geographic breakdown for metrics will be census tracts and citywide. Additional Neighborhood level and building level data will also be used as appropriate for program tracking.

Engagement Tracking

The group also recommends the tracking of engagement efforts separately and in addition to the metrics adopted by the Clean Energy Partnership Board. All program engagement should include clear outcome measures specific to program goals and outcomes.

Attachment C

APPENDIX B

Proposed Clean Energy Partnership Metrics

	Metric	Unit(s)	Geography
1	Citywide GHG emissions	metric tons of CO2e	citywide
1.1	GHG emissions from electricity use	metric tons of CO2e	citywide
1.2	GHG emissions from natural gas use	metric tons of CO2e	citywide
2	Commercial building energy use	kWh, therms	citywide
2.1	Commercial building benchmarking results	Average ENERGY STAR score, Average EUI, Total EUI	buildings covered by ordinance
2.2	Commercial utility EE program utilization	Participation, incentive dollars, estimated energy savings, estimated cost savings	citywide
3	Residential building energy use	kWh, therms	citywide
4	Local or directly purchase renewable energy	mWhs	census tract
4.1	WindSource customers	count of customers, mWhs	census tract
4.2	Community solar garden subscribers	count of customers, mWhs	census tract
5	Home Energy Squad visits	count of HES visits (rental and owner-occupied), estimated energy savings, estimated cost savings	census tract
5.1	Percent of eligible properties served by HES	percentage of eligible properties	census tract
5.2	HES-driven loans	count of loans, loan value	census tract
6	Low-income visits	count of CIP low income and WAP visits, estimated energy savings, estimated cost savings	census tract
7	Air sealing/insulation (ASI)	participation, estimated energy savings, estimated cost savings	census tract
8	Multi-family program participation	count of visits, count of dwelling units served, estimated energy savings, estimated cost savings	census tract
8.1	Percent of eligible MF properties served by MFBE	percentage of eligible properties	census tract
8.2	Percent of properties participating in MFBE that engaged in activity beyond audit & direct install (conversion rate)	Percent of properties	census tract